

**PUBLIC VERSION**

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS  
EASTERN DIVISION**

FRANK CARBONE, ANDREW CORZO,  
SAVANNAH ROSE EKLUND, SIA HENRY,  
ALEXANDER LEO-GUERRA, MICHAEL  
MAERLANDER, BRANDON PIYEVSKY, KARA  
SAFFRIN, and BRITTANY TATIANA WEAVER,  
individually and on behalf of all others similarly  
situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BROWN UNIVERSITY, CALIFORNIA  
INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY, UNIVERSITY  
OF CHICAGO, THE TRUSTEES OF COLUMBIA  
UNIVERSITY IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK,  
CORNELL UNIVERSITY, TRUSTEES OF  
DARTMOUTH COLLEGE, DUKE UNIVERSITY,  
EMORY UNIVERSITY, GEORGETOWN  
UNIVERSITY, THE JOHNS HOPKINS  
UNIVERSITY, MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE  
OF TECHNOLOGY, NORTHWESTERN  
UNIVERSITY, UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME  
DU LAC, THE TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY  
OF PENNSYLVANIA, WILLIAM MARSH RICE  
UNIVERSITY, VANDERBILT UNIVERSITY, and  
YALE UNIVERSITY,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:22-cv-00125

Judge Matthew F. Kennelly

**DECLARATION BY DAVID GRINGER IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' MOTION  
TO EXCLUDE EXPERT TESTIMONY AND OPINIONS OF HAL SINGER, GEORGE  
BULMAN, AND ELIZABETH MORA**

I, David Gringer, do hereby declare as follows:

1. I am a partner at the law firm of Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP, and counsel for The Trustees of The University of Pennsylvania in the above-captioned case.
2. I submit this declaration in support of Defendants' Motion to Exclude Expert

**PUBLIC VERSION**

Testimony and Opinions of Hal Singer, George Bulman, and Elizabeth Mora. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein.

3. Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the Rebuttal Report of Bridget Terry Long, dated August 7, 2024.

4. Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the Rebuttal Report of Nicholas Hill, dated August 7, 2024.

5. Exhibit 3 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Kathryn Tuman, which took place on September 8, 2023.

6. Exhibit 4 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Diane Corbett, which took place on January 8, 2024.

7. Exhibit 5 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of John DeGioia, which took place on February 16, 2024.

8. Exhibit 6 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Elaine Varas as 30(b)(6) representative of The Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania, which took place on March 18, 2024.

9. Exhibit 7 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Becky Maxson, which took place on November 17, 2023.

10. Exhibit 8 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Brent Tener, which took place on July 12, 2023.

11. Exhibit 9 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Hal Singer, which took place on November 27, 2024.

12. Exhibit 10 is a true and correct copy of the Amended Report of Hal Singer, dated May 14, 2024.

13. Exhibit 11 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Elizabeth Mora, which took place on October 29, 2024.

14. Exhibit 12 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of plaintiff Benjamin Shumate, which took place on September 12, 2023.

**PUBLIC VERSION**

15. Exhibit 13 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number SHUMATE\_00000001, dated December 14, 2022.

16. Exhibit 14 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number SHUMATE\_00000007, dated December 14, 2022.

17. Exhibit 15 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number SHUMATE\_00000009, dated December 14, 2022.

18. Exhibit 16 is a true and correct copy of the Rebuttal Report of Hal Singer, dated October 7, 2024.

19. Exhibit 17 is a true and correct copy of Joshua D. Angrist and Jörn-Steffen Pischke, *Mostly Harmless Econometrics: An Empiricist's Companion* (Princeton University Press, 2008) §2.1.

20. Exhibit 18 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of ABA, *Proving Antitrust Damages: Legal and Economic Issues*, 3rd ed. (Chicago: American Bar Association, Section of Antitrust Law, 2017) §6(2)(A).

21. Exhibit 19 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the Surrebuttal Report of Nicholas Hill, dated November 1, 2024.

22. Exhibit 20 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number Columbia\_00015333. The document is undated.

23. Exhibit 21 is a true and correct copy of a webpage titled "GSP Program History," captured on December 13, 2024, available at <https://gsp.georgetown.edu/about/gsp-program-history/>.

24. Exhibit 22 is a true and correct copy of an article published in the *Cornell Chronicle* titled "Cornell Drops Need-Based Loans for Students from Families Earning Under \$75,000," published on January 31, 2008.

25. Exhibit 23 is a true and correct copy of an excerpt of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number DARTMOUTH\_0000359371, dated, November 28, 2005.

26. Exhibit 24 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation

with Bates number COFHE-02-00002603, dated June 2001.

27. Exhibit 25 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the Surrebuttal Report of Lauren J. Stiroh, dated November 1, 2024.

28. Exhibit 26 is a true and correct copy of the Supplemental Rebuttal Report of Hal Singer, dated November 11, 2024.

29. Exhibit 27 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the Rebuttal Report of Lauren J. Stiroh, dated August 7, 2024.

30. Exhibit 28 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Kim Downs-Burns, which took place on March 5, 2024.

31. Exhibit 29 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number PENN568-LIT-00162887, dated December 2016.

32. Exhibit 30 is a true and correct copy of Winston, Subsidies, *Hierarchy and Peers: The Awkward Economics of Higher Education*, 13 J. HIGHER EDUC. 13, 27 (Winter 1999).

33. Exhibit 31 is a true and correct copy of a U.S. News & World Report article titled “15 National Universities With The Biggest Endowments,” from October 2, 2023.

34. Exhibit 32 is a true and correct copy of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number Emory\_568Lit\_0058886, dated September 7, 2014.

35. Exhibit 33 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of a document produced in this litigation with Bates number PENN568-LIT-00089925, dated May 28, 2013.

36. Exhibit 34 is a true and correct copy of an article from The New York Times Magazine, titled “The Top U.S. Colleges With The Greatest Economic Diversity,” from September 7, 2023.

37. Exhibit 35 is a true and correct copy of the Report of George Bulman, which dated May 14, 2024.

38. Exhibit 36 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of George Bulman, which took place on November 4, 2024.

**PUBLIC VERSION**

39. Exhibit 37 is a true and correct copy of the Rebuttal Report of George Bulman, dated October 7, 2024.

40. Exhibit 38 is a true and correct copy of a working paper by George Bulman titled “The Effect of College and University Endowments on Financial Aid, Admissions, and Student Composition,” dated August 2022.

41. Exhibit 39 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the Rebuttal Report of David L. Yermack, dated August 7, 2024.

42. Exhibit 40 is a true and correct copy of excerpts of the deposition transcript of Peter Ammon, which took place on October 25, 2024.

43. Exhibit 41 is a true and correct copy of the Report of Elizabeth Mora, dated May 14, 2024.

44. Exhibit 42 is a true and correct copy of the Rebuttal Report of Elizabeth Mora, dated October 7, 2024.

I declare under penalty of perjury of the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Executed on December 16, 2024 in New York, NY.

/s/ David Gringer

David Gringer